Guide to Criteria for Music Department Personnel and Budget Committee Considerations on Full-Time Faculty Reappointment, Tenure and Promotion

(Please note: at the end of this document can be found information specific to the discipline of Music, in terms of the definition of scholarship and creative activities and how those areas are considered.)

I. First Reappointment Candidates for reappointment at the end of their initial term of appointment on a full-time line shall be evaluated on the basis of the following criteria:

(A) Teaching Effectiveness - There are a variety of ways, including classroom observations done by senior peers, to evaluate this criterion. The evaluation, however, extends beyond the classroom, since the faculty member’s obligation to the students goes beyond normal class hours. P&B committee members also consider student evaluations as a factor in assessing the teaching effectiveness of an instructor.

(B) Scholarly and Professional Growth - Candidates in tenure bearing titles for the first reappointment are expected to demonstrate their potential for scholarly work and their achievement in some of the following ways:

1. Evidence of research in progress leading toward scholarly publication.
2. Publication in professional journals, preferably peer-reviewed.
3. Creative works, such as compositions, master classes, lecture/recitals and solo and/or chamber music performances.
4. Development of improved instructional materials or methods.
5. Participation in activities of professional societies.

(C) Service to the Department/College/University - Since all full-time faculty members share broad responsibilities toward the institution, work in departmental, college and university committees will be considered in over-all evaluations. It is understood that not all junior faculty members will have an opportunity to serve on important committees, especially during their first year, but evaluation will consider evidence of their informal contributions to such committee work and their participation in other regular administrative activities such as governance, registration, advisement, library and cultural activities.

(D) Service to the Community - A candidate, though not expected to do so for the first reappointment, may offer evidence of pertinent and significant community and public service in support of reappointment.
II. Second and Subsequent Reappointments. In addition to criteria for the first reappointment, candidates for the second or subsequent reappointment shall be evaluated on the basis of the following criteria:

(A) Teaching Effectiveness - Evaluation of this criterion shall include contractual teaching observations and peer judgments, including: the instructor's observed control of the subject matter and the distinctive methods of the discipline; the instructor’s demonstrated ability to communicate with students in the classroom; the instructor’s observed effectiveness in stimulating thought and the ability to foster active participation in the learning process on the part of students; the instructor’s observed ability to awaken a conscious sense of a learning experience among the students of his or her classroom; the assessment of the instructor's effort and success in developing new methods and materials suited to the need of his students; the assessment of student evaluations; and evidence of other non-classroom educational efforts such as academic advisement and student support.

(B) Scholarly and Professional Growth - Candidates for the second and subsequent reappointments are expected to offer evidence of scholarly contributions to their disciplines. Examples are outlined above, in B (1-5). Evaluations of the quality of such work may be sought from outside the department. Achievements in the period following the last reappointment will be evaluated on the basis of: publications of scholarly works in professional journals, or in the reports of professional organizations; scholarly books and monographs; evidence of work in progress; creative works, such as compositions, master classes, lecture/recitals and solo and/or chamber music performances. The department P&B is less concerned with the actual number of publications, performances and creative works, but more with the demonstration that said achievements are recurring consistently, year over year, and that prolonged gaps with no achievements made are not occurring.

(C) Service to the Department/College/University - Effective service on departmental, college, and university committees is expected. Faculty members should strive to find service opportunities that align strongly with personal interests, as this will motivate continuity of service from year to year, and which may also present leadership opportunities. Impressive service records from year to year reflect staying with a particular committee over a longer period of time (a minimum of two years) and ultimately showing leadership of some type. At the very least, faculty members should be able to demonstrate ways in which their service on a particular committee helped to further the work of the committee and made a contribution to the college.

(D) Service to the Community – It is hoped that faculty are able to contribute their services to the welfare of the community in some way. Although such activities are a matter of individual discretion and opportunity, evaluation of a faculty member for reappointment will recognize pertinent and significant professional activities on behalf of the QCC community and beyond. The absence of this contribution, however, will not work to the disadvantage of any candidate for reappointment.

Please note: Judgments on candidates for reappointment beyond the first year become progressively rigorous. In the second and subsequent reappointments, a candidate should be able to demonstrate that he or she has realized some of his or her full scholarly potential. Similarly,
standards of acceptable performance as a teacher will be graduated to reflect the greater expectations of more experienced faculty members.

III. Tenure. In addition to criteria for the first reappointment and for the second and subsequent reappointments, candidates for tenure shall be evaluated on the basis of the following criteria:

(A) Teaching Effectiveness - Tenure appointments shall be made only when there is clear evidence of the individual's ability and diligence as an effective, if not outstanding, teacher. All of the criteria noted in section II (A) above are reaffirmed. In addition to those criteria being met, a candidate for tenure must demonstrate the ability to adapt and grow, based upon the changing needs of students and the necessity that pedagogical theories and approaches are not static, but rather evolve and adapt. The candidate for tenure should be able to demonstrate that his or her teaching methods have developed a level of sophistication not found in teachers who are just starting their teaching careers; indeed, candidates should strive to show ways in which their teaching has quite possibly opened up new pedagogical methods that may be shared with others, or even serve as the basis for publishable work in journals or presentations at conferences.

(B) Scholarly and Professional Growth - Evidence of new and creative work shall be sought in the candidate's published research and in instructional materials and techniques when they incorporate new ideas or scholarly research. Works will be evaluated as well as listed, and works in progress will be assessed. Again, the criteria noted in section II (B) above are reaffirmed. The candidate for tenure should have a substantial record of professional activities (publications of scholarly works in professional peer-reviewed journals, or in the reports of professional organizations; scholarly books and monographs; evidence of work in progress; creative works, such as compositions, master classes, lecture/recitals and solo and/or chamber music performances) that demonstrates mastery in the field and the development of a solid reputation among his or her peers.

(C) Service to the Department/College/University - Faculty members will be judged on the degree and quality of their participation in department, college and university committees, activities, and service. Similarly, faculty contributions to student welfare, through service on committees or as an advisor to student organizations, will be recognized. Candidates for tenure must demonstrate committed service over time to department/college/university committees, and either leadership roles must be shown, or demonstrable contributions to the work of the committee must be detailed.

(D) Service to the Community - Service to the community, state and nation, both in the tenure candidate’s special capacity as a scholar/performer/creative artist and in areas beyond this when the work is pertinent and significant, will be recognized. The absence of this contribution, however, will not work to the disadvantage of any candidate for tenure.
IV. Promotion to Associate Professor

Candidates for promotion to Associate Professor must show in all categories enumerated above (Teaching Effectiveness, Scholarly and Professional Growth, Service to Department/College/University, and if applicable, Service to the Community) evidence of continuing growth and accomplishment since tenure, including further evidence of scholarly/creative activities achievement (through the means noted above) and significant service contributions. Evidence of continuing excellence as a teacher can be provided as noted above; in addition, faculty members may request a peer observation by the department chairperson, which is normally not conducted after the contractual number of ten observations has been performed.

A note on special applications of the notion of “scholarship” in the field of music. Music historians and music theorists can meet scholarly obligations of peer-reviewed research in professional publications in ways that are typical of many other disciplines: in peer-reviewed journals; in books and monographs from established and reputable publishers; in conference presentations given at meetings of professional societies in music (e.g., The American Musicological Society, The Society for Music Theory, The College Music Society, and others), whether national or regional, and in pedagogical work, such as textbooks and manuals.

Composers and performers do not generally have such outlets available to them for their scholarship and creative work and activities.

The National Association of Schools of Music, the only national accreditor of music programs for colleges, universities, schools of music and conservatories, provides these guidelines for assessing the work of composers and performers in the context of faculty reappointment, tenure and promotion:

The creative production and professional work of performers, composers, and other applied faculty should be accepted as equivalent to scholarly publication or research as a criterion for appointment and advancement in all institutions.

In accordance to the NASM definition, performers, composers and other applied faculty shall remain professionally active in the field through the creation, exhibition and recognition of creative productions.

Exhibition of the creative production can be any public performance, with further significance assigned to the following:

Production exhibited
- in an established concert series
- by an established organization
- in a university, college or other educational organization different from the faculty member’s institution
- at a conferences or festival
Further significance is assigned by the recognition of the creative production through:
- publication of the creative production
- recording of the creative production
- award or honor bestowed upon the creative production
- grant or commissioned funding of the creative production
- or any equivalent

Criteria for awarding significance to the exhibition or recognition of the creative production also considers the following:
- evaluated/chosen through a peer review process
- evaluated/chosen through a blind peer reviewed process
- invited/evaluated or chosen through an independent entity or organization

Also considered in the significance is:
- the number of submission and/or or acceptance rate
- the scope of the creative project
- the prestige of the venue, or of the presenting/awarding organization
- potential for visibility of the exhibition or recognition
- scope of the venue or the presenting/awarding organization (local, regional, national and international)

The skills of performers, composers and other applied faculty require constant study and use in order to maintain professional levels. Often performers, composers, and other applied faculty participate in multiple types of music scholarship, including pedagogical and traditional research based scholarship. Thus such criteria as sustained and varied achievement is also appropriate when considering significance.